

Native Reader's Expectations toward Indonesian Students' Writing: Islamic Higher Education Context

Deny Efita Nur Rakhmawati¹ and Mira Shartika¹

¹*Department of English Literature, Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, Indonesia*

Keywords: Native Reader's Expectations, Indonesian College Students, Essay Writing

Abstract: This research, which aims to find out native reader's expectations toward EFL students' writing, employs a descriptive qualitative design as it observes and analyses the Indonesians' essay writings. In collecting the data, the teacher asked the students to discuss the cultural topics given in the form of group discussion. Then, each student's essay writing was commented by the native speaker related to her expectation on the writing based on the given topic. The result revealed that several students have the tendency to use their native language pattern, although they wrote essays in English. Besides, grammatical mistakes and inappropriate vocabularies usage were found in most essays, which mainly contributed to determining and fulfilling the native reader's expectation and resulted in native reader's misunderstanding. The findings also showed that most students had problems with the language use. Furthermore, the clarity of writing could not be seen in the majority of the Indonesian essay writings. Nevertheless, there were several students who were able to write essays using appropriate words and effective patterns.

1 INTRODUCTION

Language cannot be separated from culture (Seidl, 1998). Thus, a number of studies have been conducted to investigate the inextricable connection of language and culture (Crozet & Liddicoat, 1997; Kramsch, Cain, & Murphy-Lejeune, 1996; Seidl, 1998). Generally, in language class, a language learner is required to learn the culture of that language. This is sometimes difficult, considering the fact that learners have their own culture or subcultures to bring to the class. Another reason, time can be the major problem to facilitate the teaching of these cultures.

It is even more difficult in EFL writing class. Students have to learn how to write compositions in English. Bringing their cultures and subcultures, students should be able to write compositions which are "communicative" (Hinds, 1987). This is quite challenging because the gaps between EFL students' culture and English culture are high. In addition, culture influences writing habits and appears not only among cultures with major differences, but also the minor ones (Ahmed, 2010). It is proven by the clear differences of the texts produced by Finnish and Anglo-Americans, caused by the influence of

their first cultures, resulting in the difference of rhetorical preferences (Ahmed, 2010).

Taking the aforementioned example into account, it is highly probable that the English texts written by the EFL students in the Indonesian Islamic higher education—who are Muslims—will have a different rhetorical organization from those written by native speakers. This might cause several problems, especially for native English readers.

Several approaches to contrastive rhetoric have explained that the differences in writing are derived from "multiple sources, including L1 national culture, L1 educational background, disciplinary background, genre characteristics and mismatched expectations between readers and writers" (Connor, 1996). This research is conducted to gain a better understanding in such context in writing pedagogy. Based on the above phenomenon, this study is intended to find out how native reader's expectations toward EFL students' writing and how their Islamic cultural background influences their writing.

2 LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Readers' Expectation

English is a writer-responsible language, tending to prefer specificity (Salies, 2013). Consequently, the writers are required to meet the expectations of literate readers of Standard English. They are also expected to produce texts that have a unique personality or voice. In line with this, writing as readers or writers responsible rhetoric, according to the degree to which readers are required to make inferential bridges between propositions and to deduce meaning from a text, as opposed to the degree of the writer's duty to explicitly provide explanations of propositions (Hinds, 1987). Thus, it can be concluded that writers are fully responsible for what they state in their compositions.

Furthermore, the structure of sentences favors a description in which the grammatical relation subject-predicate assumes primary importance becomes one of the examples that writers becomes subjects prominent in English. It can be seen from the perceived subjectivity of the self of western people in allowing individuals to have their own perceptions, opinions, choices, and creativity. It is reflected in how they implicitly accept their children to make their own decisions, develop their own opinions, solve their own problems, have their own possessions, and learn to view the world from the point of view of the self.

In contrast, Indonesians try to see themselves as a part of the community by not trying to excel others or showing off (Kuntjara, 2004). It is considered as a low profile attitude that enhances harmony and has a positive effect in communication. The best way to show this is by concealing themselves in the *we* group, especially when they write. Even when they have ideas that they want to put forward, the safest way is to state it in: *we think* or *we believe* statements rather than an assertion of *I think* or *I believe*. In one sense, they will look modest, but in another sense they may lessen the responsibility of proposing that statement as their own idea. However, this is not what the native readers expect since they like something specific and concern on independence.

Western people also find clarity in language usage better than ambiguity since precision leads to practical action. If the message is understood, then language and communication are good (Stewart & Bennet, 2001). They tend to write deductively by showing specificity in their writing. On the other hand, Indonesians are very sensitive to other

people's feelings so as not to hurt others. Many people also think that stating things directly and explicitly may sound too blunt or too aggressive and it can be considered as impolite. One way to be implicit is to use the inductive way of expressing ideas. They may state things that are not at all related to what they really want. Other persons should figure out themselves what they mean (Kuntjara, 2004). It truly does not meet the native readers' expectation since they will take more time to get the main idea of that is actually can be stated simply. They expect a deductive writing with the values of explicitness, clarity and straightforwardness.

Another issue is that English writing always asks the writers to give facts and statistics since they are considered to be the strongest method of support in English and that when the writers make an assertion, it must be supported with specific examples or quantifiable measures. Other cultures may rely on the hierarchical, rather than the scientific, model of proof. It is not unusual, for example, to have EFL students use quotes from religious books or statements made by a political leader as evidence for their assertions. Students will need practice in identifying and supplying the kinds of support expected in academic writing in English.

2.2 Rhetorical Organization

The different rhetorical styles in writing have been studied by many researchers. The study of the differences that occur between the discourses of different languages and cultures as reflected in foreign students' writing is called as contrastive rhetoric. It is also an area of research in foreign language learning focuses on the problems in academic writing encountered by foreign language writers by referring them to the rhetorical strategies of the first language. Contrastive rhetoric is "an investigation area that is directly relevant to a pedagogically-oriented study of academic English" because of the insights it offers into differences between languages at the discourse level (Swales, 1990). Language and writing are cultural phenomena, and, as a direct consequence, each language has unique rhetorical conventions (Connor, 1996).

For Indonesians as foreign students, linguistic and cultural patterns transfer to their writing in English not only at the word and sentence level but also at the discourse level (Moran, 1991) since their original styles may not work with the new tasks assigned by the teachers, they need to adapt to the

new academic context which has its own conventions (Jordan, 1997).

The organization, writing of native speakers of English favors linearity, Arabic speakers parallelism, Romance language speakers digressions in the way they compose, and Asians indirection (Kaplan, 1966). He depicts the organization of paragraphs written by native speakers of English as a straight, vertical line to represent the linearity of the organizational pattern. On the other hand, he represented Semitic rhetorical patterns by a zigzagged line and Oriental (Asian) rhetoric by a spiral circle. It shows that each language has its own thought pattern which are reflected in its rhetoric styles of writing.

This knowledge can be applied in EFL writing pedagogy by informing and educating EFL students about the rhetorical traditions of both their native and target languages (Leki, 1991), teaching them to appreciate their own native rhetorical traditions, to identify cross-cultural differences, and to make the transition to the organizational patterns of the target language (Mok, 1993).

Contrastive rhetoric focuses attention on seven types of knowledge in the teaching of writing: (1) knowledge of rhetorical patterns of arrangement and the relative frequency of various patterns (e.g. exposition/argument: classification, definition, etc.); (2) knowledge of composing conventions and strategies needed to generate text (e.g. pre-writing, data-collection, revision, etc.); (3) knowledge of the morphosyntax of the target language, particularly as it applies to the intersentential level; (4) knowledge of the coherence-creating mechanisms of the target language; (5) knowledge of the writing conventions of the target language in the sense of both frequency and distribution of types and text appearance (e.g. letter, essay, report); (6) knowledge of the audience characteristics and expectations in the target culture; and (7) knowledge of the subject to be discussed, including both what everyone knows in the target culture and specialist knowledge (Grabe & Kaplan, 1996).

2.3 Cultural Impact on Students' Writing

As most Indonesian EFL learners in the Islamic University, where the study was undertaken, were graduated from Islamic Boarding house/schools, the cultural impact of Islam was increasing. Their writings were influenced by Arabic writing style, rather than by western style. Consequently, they would have some challenges in expressing their

ideas critically and creatively in the form of logical essay writing, just like what we usually found from an English text. Previous studies have been conducted to know the cultural transfer of Islam into English essays written by Arabian EFL students.

First, Rass (1994) shows that Arab students do not consider readers when they are producing English texts. Moreover, they also develop their ideas in Arabic, their native language, and they translate the development of ideas into English (Khuwaileh & Shoumali, 2000). As the reflection of their thought patterns, Arab produces long and indirect English text, just like when they write their personal letters (Al-Khatib, 2001).

In addition, growing in a collectivism culture, Arab tends to be in groups rather than individuals and it can be seen from the way they use pronouns expressing collectiveness and togetherness, 'we' and 'us' (Feghali, 1997). As Muslim usually recites The Holy Qur'an, he says that Arab uses repetition in their English texts, which totally in contrast with the concept of how usually native speakers write their essays. They repeat words, phrases and sentences in order to convince the readers. At last, Arabic speakers tend to exaggerate and over-assert things to convince and persuade the readers (Feghali, 1997).

3 METHOD

This research employed a descriptive qualitative design as it observed and analyzed the Indonesians' essay writings through non-numerical data but accumulation of information analyzed descriptively. The qualitative design was applied in order to obtain information by questioning, engaging, observing, and analysing the Indonesian students' essay writings. The subjects of this research were the second year students of English department in an Islamic university in Malang taking Writing II course in 2016-2017 academic years.

The data of this study were the students' essay writings, which were narrative essays with the topic of cultural bases. To analyse the data, essay writings of fifteen students were selected randomly. During the observation, any details relating to the students' discussion on cultural topics were included in field notes. Unstructured text data and the open-ended questionnaires were also helpful to provide supporting data and verify the information gained from observations and field-note traces.

In collecting the data, the teacher asked the students to discuss the cultural topics given in the form of group discussion. They discussed how to elaborate the topic into the draft of their essay

writings. This topic was given to the students in different meetings in about two months. After discussing the topics and the drafts in the form of groups, the students started writing and collected the essays in the form of soft files. From several meetings, there were about fifteen essay writings chosen randomly for the data of this study. These essay writings were sent via email to the English native speaker who had been contacted previously and agreed to help reading and analysing the students' essays writing related to her expectation. In this study, the native speaker became the native reader.

The analysis was done in several steps. First, the native reader was requested to read the foreign language students' compositions. Then, each composition was commented related to her expectation on the writings based on the given topic. A writing rubric was provided for her, so that she could comment on the compositions based on their writing structure, grammar, and chosen vocabularies. Finally, the native reader was requested to give overall comments, reviews, and critics on the writings based on the easiness to understand the essay content regarding students' direct or indirectness in writing a narrative. The native reader was also questioned about the cultural values included in the narrative essays.

4 DISCUSSION

When EFL students write English compositions, it is significant for them to know how native speakers think when they do similar things. This research, therefore, places this issue to discuss. To answer the research problem, an English native speaker was requested to be a native reader. She was asked to score and comment the students' essay writings, which were narrative essays. The essays' topics were western culture based on the movie they had ever watched.

There were 15 narrative essay writings chosen from three different categories: good, average, and low levels of essay writings. The levels were based on the score given by the native reader. Good score means the composition's structure is easy to follow and contains very minimum grammatical mistakes and inappropriate vocabularies. Low level is in the other way round.

Then, the analysis was done on the basis of the native reader's expectations (Hinds, 1987; Stewart & Bennett, 2011), which was related to four aspects: easiness in following the flow of essay due to

grammatical mistakes and vocabularies inappropriateness, perception in viewing the whole essay due to grammatical mistakes and vocabulary usage, understanding of the whole essay due to direct or indirect way of expressing ideas, and expectation on cultural values.

4.1 Easiness in Following the Flow of Essay Due to Grammatical Mistakes and Vocabularies Inappropriateness

The first aspect to discuss is easiness in following the flow of essay due to grammatical mistakes and vocabularies usage. The essays that would be analysed were under several titles covering Christmas, Bonfire Night, Halloween Party, Thanksgiving, Valentine's Day, and Summer Festival.

Most of the essays contained some grammatical mistakes. The example of the mistake could be seen from an essay entitled Christmas. The native reader mentioned that the grammatical mistake was apparent in the following sentence: "Some of westerners *dressed and act* like Santa clause." The tense of 'dressed' and 'act' were not in a parallel form. It should be 'dress and act' or 'dressed and acted'.

Another example of grammatical mistake could be found in the essay writing entitled Halloween Party. The composition contained major grammatical mistakes. One of the grammatical mistakes could be seen from the first sentence of the essay. The native reader commented that this sentence used clumsy and convoluted phrase. The sentence was: "Halloween party is one of western culture which is held every October 31st". This sentence was passively phrased.

Next example of grammatical mistake was evident an essay about Thanksgiving. The mistaken grammatical form could be seen from one of the sentences produced by the students: "Based on the movie that I watched, it talked about how the westerners did some costumes for two days in thanksgiving party, such as visited to their family and friends, dinner together and went to shopping." The native reader says that this is a very awkward sentence. There is no sentence agreement and it takes a long time for her to realize that the student must mean 'customs' not 'costumes'.

There was only one essay that contained minor grammatical mistakes. The essay entitled Bonfire Night. Yet, several inappropriate vocabularies appeared in the essay, which could be seen from:

"Bonfire night is an annual festival which is identical with firework, certain costume and food." Here the native reader was not sure what the use of 'identical' meant. She was not able to identify whether the reader tried to express whether that festival was always celebrated with firework, certain costumes, and food or not.

Furthermore, the inappropriate vocabulary could be identified from an essay about Valentine's Day. The incorrect vocabulary could be seen in the following sentence: "...some people commonly choose or decorate their date in such a romantic setting, for example, putting love balloons in the whole space and playing romantic songs." The usage of "decorate their date" implies the person is decorating their lover, not the 'date venue'. In this case, the writer just chooses a word that is actually giving different meaning. Here, the writer does not aware that he just uses a word that can bring another meaning to the sentence he just writes which makes the native reader difficult to understand what the writer means.

Moreover, the inappropriate vocabulary usage, although just one vocabulary, would lead the native reader into the different direction of understanding. It could be found in the phrase of Summer Festival essay: "on the acme of summer festival". The native reader does not understand the meaning of the word 'acme'. She also thinks that the word does not exist in English vocabulary.

According to the native reader, grammatical mistakes involving the incorrect use of tense, incorrect sentence structure, the missing articles and long convolutes sentences, which interrupted the flow of the essay, and frequent changing of tense, which was used inappropriately, could be another challenging factors to understand the flow of the essay. Several essays that contained major grammatical mistakes and inappropriate vocabularies were not easy to read.

4.2 Perception in Viewing the Whole Essay Due to Grammatical Mistake and Vocabularies Usage

The second aspect of the native reader's expectation related to the perception in viewing the whole essay due to grammatical mistakes and vocabularies usage. This discussion is related to the first discussion since it also deals with grammatical mistakes and vocabularies inappropriateness in the students' essay writing. While the first discussion focuses on the native reader's easiness to follow the

flow of the essay, this second discussion relies on the native reader's perception on the whole essay.

First, the native reader said that the perception of the whole essay would be influenced by several confusing sentences in the essay. One of the essays contained major grammatical mistakes that were very fatal and unacceptable. The grammatical mistakes in this essay could easily be forgiven if the student was writing a narrative to a friend. However, as an academic essay, the validity of the content would be severely undermined by the method of delivery which makes it very difficult to read. Numerous confusing sentences made it impossible to keep a 'flow' and frame a perception. In particular, the sentence: "After they feel tired because they are dancing, this are waited the most by the participants" is considered as convoluting sentences. These sentences are also felt out of place and do not flow with the rest of the description of events that occur at a Halloween party.

Another thing that could be initiated from this part of the discussion is about the mistakes made by the students. The mistakes would also influence the strength of the essay. As it is said by the native reader on one of the student's essay writing, that there are a few awkward sentences and instances of inappropriate vocabulary that have a dramatic impact on the overall strength and readability of the essay, for example: "Most of western people appreciate Christmas with luxury and great gift."

Another impact on native reader's perception is exacerbated by frequent changing of tense. The changing of tense from one paragraph to the other paragraphs would totally impact on the perception of the native reader. The tense inconsistency would influence the meaning of the text, as in this essay, that talks about a tradition that is celebrated every year. Thus, It should use simple present tense rather than past tense. The use of past tense here was questioned by the native reader since she considers that when the writer uses the past tense to describe an event or tradition, this would mean that tradition is no longer done nowadays. More importantly, there is another essay that does not contain many grammatical errors or instances of the inappropriate vocabulary. In this sense, it is quite easy to read. However, compared to many of the other essays, the student has "played it safe" and avoided detailed, long descriptions or varied vocab. Therefore, the native reader's perception is that while it is "correct", it is not as effective as some of the essays with more grammatical errors but it also has more developed content.

Despite the fatal grammatical errors made by the students, there were few students who just did

great jobs in writing the essays. One of the students made very few grammatical errors. They used articles correctly (many students have been skipping these) and created sentences with varying length. The vocabulary used was effective and varied. With the exception of a confusing sentence in the last paragraph, this essay could have been written by an English speaker. This comment clearly shows that very few grammatical mistakes and vocabularies inappropriateness makes the native reader easily frame a perception from what she read.

On the other hand, another comment—a positive one—was given by the native reader to one of the students who made few grammatical mistakes and used inappropriate vocabularies. She said that overall, the grammatical errors do not heavily influence her perception of the essay. Most mistakes were fairly minor and did not change the meaning of the text and did not impact upon the native reader's perception on the essay. The essay was also read well and rarely tripped the reader up with its wording. This could be said that minor mistakes on tenses and vocabularies would make the native reader easily understand the meaning of the text and help a lot to have the perception of the whole essay.

4.3 Understanding of the Whole Essay Due to Directness or Indirectness Way of Writing the Text

Third aspect relates to native readers' expectation is the understanding of the native reader due to direct and indirectness way of writing the text. General topic would take very important role in forming the native reader's perception on the essay writing. Although there was some indirectness, however, when dealing with a 'safe' and narrative topic such as Christmas, she did not find that any indirectness on behalf of the student negatively impacted on her understanding of the essay. The indirectness was influenced by the Indonesian cultural background. By writing general topic like this, it still could be tolerated. More importantly, indirect way of writing could be easily found in the ESL's essay writing, which tends to occur during pieces of writing that are supposed to be persuasive. When students are trying to prove/explore a fact-based hypothesis in their essays, a reluctance to be direct could come across as a lack of knowledge and/or lack of ability to back up their assertions. This seriously undermines the credibility of these pieces of work.

In fact, safe topic such as Christmas seems not always working in helping the ESL students to deal

with indirectness. Another essay writing with the same topic comes with the issues which is not only caused simply by indirectness but also by the student's constant use of ambiguous pronouns (they), which is confusing. In terms of essay conventions, the students never mention that they are drawing their information from a film. This indirectness would give different perception and lead the native reader to the wrong way. This would not be a problem if they do not refer to the film (without specifying a name) in the last paragraph. Essay conventions state that you should never introduce new information in the conclusion paragraph. Giving new information in the concluding paragraph would hang the information and confuse the flow of the essay writing. The native reader would trap with a dead end essay writing.

Directness and indirectness of the text could also be seen from diction. In an essay entitled Bonfire Night, the native reader comments that the direct language at the introductory paragraph is somewhat conversational in tone. While this might be appropriate for a descriptive essay on Bonfire night, the 'soft' language used would be frowned upon in more persuasive writing. The phrase "Have you ever heard of Bonfire Night?" would not be appropriate in more 'serious' types of essays. However, it is a good example of the way an English written narrative might utilize a 'hook' line to reel a reader in. In a word, this essay writing uses direct opening to the readers, which is okay to do as long as it is used in writing a personal essay, not the academic one.

Indirectness of writing was also found in an essay entitled Halloween Party. The indirect way this essay is written makes it difficult to understand. The student structures their sentences in a very convoluted way, which makes it challenging for the reader to stay focused. The convoluted ways of writing could be seen from some sentences that also felt out of place and did not flow with the rest of the description of events that occurred at a Halloween party. It is clearly stated when the student writes the history of Halloween in the second paragraph and then writes the history of Halloween again in the third paragraph. This should probably be placed just after the first sentence of the first paragraph of this essay. The student needs to learn to highlight the subject of the sentence most effectively.

The next essay writing shows another kind of indirectness in its text. The student's indirectness is not abundantly obvious here. Because the topic is narrative writing and not persuasive essay writing, the indirect tone does not negatively impact the

native reader's understanding of the text. It could be said that the kind of essay writing also influences the tone of the essay. Even though it is written indirectly, the perception of the native reader in understanding this essay does not change. This indirectness of course would have different impact when it is written in an argumentative or persuasive essay. This narrative essay helps the writer a lot in case of indirectness so that this indirectness could still be accepted and understood by the native reader since it does not change the meaning of the whole text.

Another essay writing totally put the native reader in difficulties to ascertain whether or not the student is indirect in their writing, because this essay is so challenging for her to read. This means that the native reader could not get the idea and information delivered in the essay writing so that she could not decide whether the style of writing is direct or indirect. However, the presence of transitional sentences between paragraphs is helpful and aligned with her expectations.

On the other hand, the rest of the essay writings show some ways of directness. There is one essay which is direct at the beginning of the essay writing and then indirect at the middle to the end of the essay writing. At least, the student has made attempts to be direct. For example, the student introduces the essay with a reference to her/his own excitement. As it can be found in the following sentence: "I am always excited to wait and see Valentine's Day every year because it is believed as the feast of saint valentine." The personal excitement here shows the directness of the writer to start the essay writing. However, she/he has a habit of being vague and indirect when describing Valentine's Day practices, and often demonstrates unclear pronoun usage. The indirectness could be identified from the way the writer writes the three body paragraphs. These three body paragraphs talk about the practices of Valentine's Day celebration whose processes are very complicated and do not get through the point straight away. Although there are a lot of awkward sentences, the structure of the essay follows English conventions of introduction, body, conclusion and this helps to guide the reader through the piece.

4.4 Expectation on Cultural Values

Expectation on cultural values is the last factor yet the main focus here. In this research, the native reader is asked to look at the values on cultural side in the ESL students' essay writing, whether the

essay writing has already delivered the cultural values or not. The data show that there were some students who wrote the same topics with different tone and way of expression especially in delivering the information of the cultural sides. The same topics used by the students are Christmas, Halloween, and Thanksgiving; while the rests are Bonfire, Prom Night, Finding Partner, Barbecue, Leap Year Proposal, Valentine's Day, and Summer Festival.

There are three different essay writings use Christmas as the idea of the writing. The first essay writing was written in a fairly straight forward way which seems to echo the native reader conventions. While the structure is linear, as Kaplan suggests, the content itself accurately describes a traditional Western Christian Christmas, except for the exchanging of gifts the day after Christmas. Another essay writing with the same topic shows that the student does a decent job of exploring the activities surrounding Christmas, such as family get together and present exchanging. However, the examples are a little vague and repetitive. Repeating examples many times in one essay writing shows that the students is not able to describe the cultural values yet. In the other essay writing, the student uses examples from movies to effectively illustrate some of the culture surrounding Christmas in the west. Subject specific vocab (such as tinsel) helps to strengthen the text and position the reader within the narrative essay.

Unlike the essay on Christmas, the native reader does not have the cultural framework to understand the piece of writing entitled Bonfire Night. However, the student does a good job of conveying what he has witnessed, even to someone who has never experienced Bonfire Night. It is a straightforward account that follows Kaplan's linear structure theory. In terms of cultural writing values, this essay ends with a summarizing statement. This is a really important convention in English essay writing and gives credibility to the rest of the writing.

The essay writing about Halloween shows that Western countries vary in their celebration of Halloween. In Australia, for example, many people do not celebrate Halloween and trick-or-treating is rare. However, the essay describes various activities that seem to be synonymous with America's Halloween traditions and therefore met the native reader's expectations. Another writing about Halloween explains that this essay provides a clear and concise description of Halloween throughout the ages and fulfills the native reader's cultural expectations. Another essay gives examples of

Halloween practices are in line with what the native reader knows about the holiday.

In addition, in Australia, there is no 'prom night'. They just have a 'graduation party'. There are some significant differences between the way American high school students and Australian high school students celebrate. However, the student shows that they have understood the material they viewed. The use of the word 'awesome' is a nice touch.

Moreover, it could be said that several students have the tendency to use their native language pattern even though they are writing essays in English. This is when the cultural transfer is likely to happen. As a consequence, the message they want to say in their essays will not be successfully delivered (Bennui, 2008). Moreover, the grammatical mistakes and inappropriate vocabulary usage found in the students' essay writing are totally able to show that these two parts have vital roles in determining and fulfilling the native reader's expectation. When these two factors happen, the native reader's expectation would not be able to be fulfilled by the essay writer, which then would possibly bring the native reader into misunderstanding. As in a study (Hinds, 1987), the structure of sentences favors a description in which the grammatical relation subject-predicate assumes primary importance.

In this research, we could see that many of the students' essay writing still have problems in the language category, it could be said that most of the students' essay writing are not too communicative enough. As it is stated earlier (Silva, 1992), one of the three categories to consider developing a proper second language writing is a language which is mainly related to grammar, vocabulary, spelling, and punctuation. All of these categories will help student-writers to produce a "communicative" English text, which can be described as, "English discourse that shows individual autonomy, inventiveness, forthrightness, action". It is also in line with a research (Ahmed, 2010), Egyptian student teachers of English experience some coherence and cohesion problems in their English writing. In relation to coherence problems in their English writing some problems are revealed such as difficulty writing the introduction, the thesis statement, the topic sentence, writing concluding sentences and writing the conclusion.

The clarity of writing could not be seen in most of the Indonesian essay writing but still there are more who were also able to write precisely and effectively. This weakness is absolutely influences the message delivered in the essay. They are not able to write straight forward about what they want to

say. Western people also find clarity in language usage as better than ambiguity since precision leads to practical action. If the message is understood, then language and communication are good.

5 CONCLUSIONS

By referring to the review of literature explicated in the background, findings of research and the discussion on the result of data analysis, the researchers can draw the following conclusions.

The result of this study reveals that several students have the tendency to use their native language pattern even though they are writing essays in English. This is when the cultural transfer is likely to happen. Besides, the grammatical mistakes and inappropriate vocabulary usage found in the students' essay writing are totally able to show that these two parts have vital roles in determining and fulfilling the native reader's expectation. When these two factors happen, the native reader's expectation would not be able to be fulfilled by the essay writer, which then would possibly bring the native reader into misunderstanding.

The students' essay writings also show that the students still have problems in the language category. It could be said that most of the students' essay writing are not too communicative enough. One of the three categories to consider developing a proper second language writing is a language which is mainly related to grammar, vocabulary, spelling, and punctuation. Furthermore, the clarity of writing could not be seen in most of the Indonesian essay writing, but still there are more who were also able to write precisely and effectively. This weakness absolutely influences the message delivered in the essay. They are not able to write straight forward about what they want to say.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We would like to extend our gratitude to Bethany Tyndall, our dearest colleague, for her thoughtful assistance in finishing this research. Miss Tyndall has a Master of TESOL degree, graduating from Flinders University, Australia, in 2012. We would also like to thank our dedicated students, who gave us permission to analyse their essays and to include them as participants of this study.

REFERENCES

- Ahmed, A.H., 2010. Students' problems with cohesion and coherence in EFL essay writing in Egypt: Different perspectives. *Literacy Information and Computer Education Journal (LICEJ)*, 1(4), pp.211-221.
- Al-Khatib, M.A., 2001. The pragmatics of letter-writing. *World Englishes*, 20(2), pp.179-200.
- Bennui, P., 2016. A study of L1 interference in the writing of Thai EFL students. *Malaysian Journal of ELT Research*, 4(1), p.31.
- Connor, U. and Connor, U.M., 1996. *Contrastive rhetoric: Cross-cultural aspects of second language writing*. Cambridge University Press.
- Connor, U., Kaplan, R. B., 1987. *Writing across languages: Analysis of L2 text*. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley.
- Feghali, E., 1997. Arab cultural communication patterns. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 21(3), pp.345-378.
- Hinds, J., 1987. Reader versus writer responsibility: A new typology. U. Connor & R. Kaplan (Eds.), *Writing across languages: Analysis of L2 texts* (pp. 141-152).
- Jordan, R.R., 1997. Identification of problems and needs: a student project. *English for academic purposes*, pp.67-89.
- Kaplan, R.B., 1966. Cultural thought patterns in intercultural education. *Language learning*, 16(1), pp.1-20.
- Khuwaileh, A.A. and Shoumali, A.A., 2000. Writing errors: A study of the writing ability of Arab learners of academic English and Arabic at university. *Language Culture and Curriculum*, 13(2), pp.174-183.
- Kramsch, C., Cain, A. and Murphy-Lejeune, E., 1996. Why should language teachers teach culture? *Language, culture and curriculum*, 9(1), pp. 99-107.
- Kuntjara, E., 2005. Cultural transfer in EFL writing: A look at contrastive rhetoric on English and Indonesian. 6(1), pp.13-29.
- Leki, I., 1991. Twenty-five years of Contrastive Rhetoric: text analysis and writing pedagogies. *TESOL Quarterly*, 25 (1), 123-143.
- Liddicoat, A. and Crozet, C., 1997. Teaching culture as an integrated-part of language teaching: an introduction. *Australian Review of Applied Linguistics. Series S*, (14), p.1.
- Mok, W.E., 1993. Contrastive rhetoric and the Japanese writer of EFL. *JALT Journal*, 15(2), pp.151-161.
- Moran, C., 1991. We Write, But Do We Read? (Computers and Controversy). *Computers and composition*, 8(3), pp.51-61.
- Rass, R.A., 2011. Cultural transfer as an obstacle for writing well in English: The case of Arabic speakers writing in English. *English Language Teaching*, 4(2), p.206.
- Saliés, T. G., 2013. Cross-cultural communication in the EFL writing class. *Revista Estudos Anglo Americanos*. (39), pp.161-182.
- Seidl, M., 1998, April. Language and culture: Towards a transcultural competence in language learning. In *Forum for Modern Language Studies* (Vol. 34, No. 2, pp. 101-113). Oxford University Press.
- Silva, T., 1992. L1 vs L2 writing: ESL graduate students' perceptions. *TESL Canada Journal*, 10(1), pp.27-47.
- Stewart, E.C. and Bennett, M.J., 2011. *American cultural patterns: A cross-cultural perspective*. Hachette UK.
- Swales, J., 1990. *Genre analysis: English in academic and research settings*. Cambridge University Press.